

ISSN 0007-0173



BRIO

*JOURNAL OF THE UNITED KINGDOM AND IRELAND BRANCH OF THE INTERNATIONAL
ASSOCIATION OF MUSIC LIBRARIES, ARCHIVES AND DOCUMENTATION CENTRES*

Spring/Summer 2015

Volume 52, No. 1

Brio: Journal of IAML(UK & Irl)

Editor:

Katharine Hogg

Brio Editor

Gerald Coke Handel Collection

Foundling Museum

40 Brunswick Square

London WC1N 1AZ

Tel: 020 7841 3606

e-mail: katharine@foundlingmuseum.org.uk

Reviews Editor:

Dr Loukia M Drosopoulou

c/o The Editor

email: loukiadrosopoulou@gmail.com

Advertising Editor:

c/o The Editor

e-mail: katharine@foundlingmuseum.org.uk

CONTENTS

Editorial	1
Obituary: Tony Lynes <i>Roger Taylor</i>	3
Oxford's Weston Library: a new home for the Bodleian's music library <i>Martin Holmes</i>	8
Putting all your eggs in one basket: Library catalogues for the twenty-first century <i>Claire Marsh</i>	17
Melodists: the Melodists' Club lingers on - from 277 words to obscurity in 131 years and seven editions <i>Oliver B. Pollak</i>	26
Book reviews	31
IAML (UK & Ireland) Executive Committee	45
Notes for contributors	46
Advertising and subscription rates	48

EDITORIAL

Katharine Hogg

The programme of the IAML (UK & Irl) Annual Study Weekend in Aston, Birmingham this year offered a range of papers and events to suit all interests in the music library world. From the global music presentation by Jane Fanshawe of One World Music, to the history of the library and archives of the Royal College of Organists, from studies in heavy metal bibliography, to the impact of digital technologies on music library provision, the papers covered a diversity of subjects. Ben Saul from the British Association for Music Therapy gave us a practical introduction to the therapeutic use of music, and a morning was devoted to visiting the spectacular new public library in Birmingham – its splendid facilities serving to underline somewhat sadly the huge cuts in opening hours now being implemented there. The public library and academic library seminars were immediately before the study weekend, allowing delegates to participate in both events without additional journeys, which again proved popular with attendees. Accounts of the sessions have been appearing on the IAML (UK&Irl) blog, which can be found at <https://iamlukirl.wordpress.com/> where you can also catch up with items from the several reports and information sessions. Particularly popular were the ‘quickfire rounds’, where colleagues led five small group discussions on a variety of subjects from ‘music events in libraries’ to ‘sourcing accessible sheet music’, which allowed participants to contribute from their experiences and ask advice in these specific areas. The busy programme included the official launch of the new platform for the Concert Programmes Project and Cecilia, the annual general meeting, and the awarding of the Oldman and Bryant Prizes.

In this issue of *Brio* Roger Taylor pays tribute to Tony Lynes and describes his illustrious career outside the music library world, which is probably unknown to many of us. Martin Holmes describes the process of moving the Bodleian music library from its old premises while a major refurbishment was undertaken, outlining some of the challenges facing the removal of a collection and facilitating access when it is not yet fully barcoded and catalogued online. The new library, which is accessible to the public for research

and includes a café and exhibition spaces, is now open and the collection has returned to greatly enhanced storage and study facilities.

In her article 'Putting all your eggs in one basket' Claire Marsh describes the changes in resource discovery at Leeds College of Music, which has moved from a standalone library catalogue to an integrated system allowing the user to search for local physical and electronic resources alongside online resources in a single interface. Her paper was presented at the IAML international conference in Antwerp last year and discusses the benefits and the drawbacks of resource discovery for music, and the theory and reality of implementing such a system, which is now in place.

Oliver B. Pollak contributes a study of the information about the Melodists Club which can be gleaned from surviving records. The club was extant in the first half of the nineteenth century and existed to promote English melody and ballad composition, its membership comprising amateur and aspiring professional musicians. Pollak's article also traces the entries relating to the Club in the various editions of Grove, illustrating the need to preserve older editions as tastes and perspectives change, and new entries 'crowd out' older ones.

Book reviews cover new publications on classical concertos, musical theory in the Renaissance, Haydn and Britain, and Boccherini's manuscripts; two of these volumes include contributions from music librarians in the UK. I am grateful to Loukia Drosopoulou for her work as reviews editor, and to all the contributors to this issue.

OBITUARY: TONY LYNES

3 October 1929 - 12 October 2014

It may seem odd that the University of London catalogue's "author information" describes Tony Lynes as a "British writer and campaigner in the field of social security and pensions" with a text identical to his Wikipedia entry, but that neither makes mention at all of him as a music librarian.¹ Indeed, he merits ten indexed references in a recent major study of the UK Welfare State.² Yet many readers of *Brio* will have known Tony as the personification of the Community & Youth Music Library [CYML], a UK national inter-loan provider of vocal, orchestral and wind band sets, and as a regular attendee at IAML(UK&Irl) Annual Study Weekends and meetings of London music librarians. Little more than three years prior to his death, he was mentioned in a 2012 Branch Newsletter, at the age of 82, as having "just completed a major stock-check of all [CYML] vocal sets".³ Google "Tony Lynes" and up comes images of his bearded smiling face that many of us remember so fondly. It was indeed due to Tony's indomitable efforts that CYML has survived - indeed thrived - into the twenty-first century as the UK's only independent and charitable performance sets lending library.

Tony's early years were spent in Willesden Green, north-west London. At the outbreak of World War 2, he was evacuated to Berkshire and became a boarder at the Newbury Grammar School. In 1959 at the age of fifteen, the respected sociologist, feminist and novelist Ann Oakley, daughter of the social policy expert Richard Titmuss, met Tony, a year after he was recruited as a researcher by her father at the London School of Economics [LSE]. In a memoir of her father published coincidentally just ten days after Tony's death, she writes:

"Tony was a grammar school boy, the son of a scrap metal and rag dealer, who trained as a chartered accountant and thus shared my father's love of actuarial calculations. After a colourful life in Malta, with regular trips to Tripoli and Benghazi auditing large commercial

¹ <http://find.senatehouselibrary.ac.uk/Author/Home?author=Lynes%2C+Tony.#expand>

² Thornton, Stephen, *Richard Crossman and the Welfare State: pioneer of welfare provision and Labour politics in post-war Britain*. I.B. Taurus & Co. Ltd., 2009, p. 205.

³ IAML (UK&Irl) Newsletter, 63 (August 2012), p.24.

companies, Tony did the social science certificate course at LSE and then worked as Richard Titmuss's research assistant, later becoming an assistant lecturer at LSE."⁴

Ann Oakley remembers herself being recruited as a flautist by Tony, as an unprecedentedly young fifteen-year-old member of the LSE Orchestra!

A literature search for Tony Lynes reveals at least fourteen published titles authored or co-authored by Tony as a national and international authority on welfare and pension rights.⁵ Included are studies of rights provision in France, the West Indies, and the Indian Ocean island of Mauritius. Tony visited the then still colonial Mauritius in August and September 1959, the first of two research visits with Richard Titmuss at the invitation of the island Governor, and co-authored the consequent 1961 report that chronologically heads the literature search. Tony's second research visit (February-March 1960) coincided with the most severe cyclone ever to hit Mauritius (Cyclone "Carol", 25th-29th February 1960, with winds reaching 160mph). Ann Oakley continues her memoir:

"The Titmuss projects to which Tony contributed most were my father's book *Income distribution and social change*, and the enquiry into social services in Mauritius. . . . His duties for the Mauritius Report positioned Tony in a terrifying encounter with what was probably the worst cyclone in Mauritian history. He hid in the basement of his hotel listening to corrugated iron roofs being torn off buildings. Not much was left of the sugar crop and work on the Titmuss Report was shelved, as Tony offered his clean-up and food-getting services to the local

⁴ Oakley, Ann, *Father and daughter: patriarchy, gender and social science*. Bristol: Policy Press, 2014, p.88.

⁵ Arranged chronologically, published works authored or co-authored by Tony Lynes include:

1961 [with Richard Titmuss and Brian Abel-Smith] *Social policies and population growth in Mauritius*. [2nd edition 1968, republished 2013 as a Kindle edition.]

1962 *National assistance and national prosperity*.

1962 [with Pearl Jephcott] *The needs of youth in the West Indies*.

1963 *Pension rights and wrongs: a critique of the Conservative scheme*.

1967 *French pensions*.

1969 *Labour's pension plan*.

1969 *Welfare rights*.

1972 *Penguin guide to supplementary benefits*. [4th edition 1981.]

1976 [with Brian Abel-Smith] *Report on the national pension scheme for Mauritius*.

1985 *Family Income Support: maintaining the value of benefits*.

1985 *Paying for pensions: the French experience*.

1986 *Unemployment Assistance Board: origins of supplementary benefit*.

1996 *Our pensions: a policy for a Labour government*.

2001 *The pension credit: the National Pensioners Convention's response to the Government consultation paper*.

people's home and orphanage. LSE complained about the waste of Tony's salary while he was engaged in this essential relief work; Richard Titmuss complained back and instructed them to forget it."⁶

Fifteen years later in 1975, Tony visited Mauritius a third time at the invitation of the by now independent Government of Mauritius, to research a national pension scheme for the island. He was accompanied then by his wife Sally who studied orphanages and infirmaries.

Tony's years at LSE have been described as amongst "a small group of academics . . . who wanted to expose the extent of poverty in Britain"⁷, and he became an expert on the Poor Law origins of national assistance.⁸ High hopes with the 1964 election of the new Harold Wilson Government gave way to frustration at its lack of action on social security. Following a meeting in 1965 with cabinet member Douglas Houghton, Tony was recruited into the Civil Service as an adviser to Margaret Herbison, Minister of Social Security, spending a year writing a memorandum on family allowances. Inhibited by Civil Service convention that he could not ask to see his minister but instead had to wait to be invited, it is said that he took to phoning her at home and asking her to invite him! Those of us who knew Tony in later life could well imagine such cussed determination to obviate any niceties of expected procedure.

Frustrated with life as a civil servant, and following evidence that those most affected by poverty were children, Tony left LSE in 1966 to become the first Secretary (a post later renamed as Chief Executive) of the Child Poverty Action Group [CPAG] - indeed its first full-time employee. "He famously attended parliamentary debates, the same day composing press releases which he then delivered, in person, to Fleet Street - all by bike"⁹. His undoubted influence is described elsewhere as "based on authority and expertise, and the capacity to use both to embarrass ministers and, through them, civil servants"¹⁰.

Following a visit to USA, Tony was the first to write about the US welfare rights movement in the CPAG journal *Poverty* (which he had initiated). His knowledge of social benefit law became increasingly in demand by social workers and led to a UK network of CPAG branches. When the nature of the post became less policy-driven and more administrative, Tony left CPAG

⁶ Oakley, Ann, *op.cit.* pp. 88-89.

⁷ Jennie Sibley's memoir *Tony Lynes - my memories of a special man*, published online by CPAG, 20 October 2014 <http://www.cpag.org.uk/content/tony-lynes-my-memories-special-man>

⁸ Alison Garnham, Chief Executive of CPAG, in an obituary published online by CPAG, 20 October 2014 <http://www.cpag.org.uk/content/child-poverty-action-group%E2%80%99s-first-director-tony-lynes-has-passed-away>

⁹ *Ibid.*

¹⁰ Professor Jonathan Bradshaw, University of York, in an online obituary *Remembering Tony Lynes*, October 2014. <http://www.cpag.org.uk/content/remembering-tony-lynes>

in November 1968 (and was succeeded by Frank Field) to become a county council welfare rights adviser - probably the first anywhere to be employed by a local authority - based in the Oxfordshire Children's Department. It was there and at the Oxford branch of CPAG that Tony met his wife Sally. During this time he led a shareholder revolt against the Distillers Company's unwillingness to compensate thalidomide victims.

He returned to London in 1974 to become a political adviser to the Department of Health and Social Security in the new Labour government. In that capacity he served Barbara Castle (who remained a friend until her death in 2002) and her successor David Ennals. Following electoral defeat in 1979, Tony continued advising the shadow social security team including Margaret Beckett, Clare Short and Paul Flynn up to 1997. Paul Flynn spoke most eloquently at the Thanksgiving and Celebration of the life of Tony Lynes held at the Conway Hall, Red Lion Square, on Thursday 23rd October 2014:

“He drafted more (and better) amendments to social security bills than anyone else, alive or dead. We know that to be true because he wrote it himself and he was a modest man . . . I relied on Tony alone. He never let us down. It was the army of Civil Servants who were out-classed by Tony's memory, skill and guile. Tony was the brain: we were the glove puppets.”¹¹

In retirement Tony became a pensions adviser to Jack Jones and the National Pensioners Convention, and devoted much time to his local Southwark Pensioners Action Group. Dora Dixon-Foyle, chair of the trustees of the Southwark Pensioners' Centre, said “He was a human dynamo. Even though he was 85 he came to the centre every day, and was always working on a new project.”¹² Having become familiar with Parliamentary procedure and the “corridors of power”, even in retirement Tony remained a regular reader of “Hansard”. He also became an active and authoritative blogger and his website continues to carry his penultimate essay dated February 2013, *Single-tier pension - but not for today's pensioners?*

The final essay on Tony's website gives the clue to what, in the context of the above, appears as virtually his alternative career as a music librarian - *Music: public library charges illegal? Public library charges for lending printed music* (dated 11 September 2013). Earliest reports from his LSE days show Tony as an active choral singer and instrumentalist. For many years he enjoyed weekly chamber music concerts at the South Place Ethical Society, Conway Hall. In Southwark he founded a pensioners' choir The Welcome

¹¹ Paul Flynn's memoir reproduced on his blog, “Read my day”, *Tony Lynes - the saint and the glove puppets*. http://paulflynnmp.typepad.com/my_weblog/2014/10/tony-lynes-the-saint-and-the-glove-puppets.html

¹² Report in the London Evening Standard by Simon Freeman, *Tributes to civil servant who was 'an architect of the welfare state'*, 19 October 2014. [Attribution to Dora Dixon-Foyle confirmed by Sally Lynes.]

Singers, but he was just as much an enthusiastic supporter of music making for young people. From this emerged his passion to preserve and maintain CYML.

The music library began more than a century ago when the London County Council became responsible for education in London. It was taken over by the Inner London Education Authority but, when ILEA was abolished in 1990, Tony became aware that the existence of the library was threatened. By then it had become a major resource of performance sets of choral, orchestral and wind band music in addition to books, single-copy and chamber music. It was preserved first by Westminster City Council, and then became the CYM Library (CYM was short for the Centre for Young Musicians, based at Morley College in Lambeth). From there the collection was acquired by Trinity College of Music at its Mandeville Place (Wigmore Street) premises, with Tony moving with it as a salaried library assistant. From 2001 the new Greenwich site lacked space to accommodate the performance sets collection. Tony plus his likewise retired friend Peter Smith safeguarded its survival by ensuring its accommodation and use at a range of locations that included at one time the crypt of a church. Finally Tony was able to establish the collection as an independent charitable company named Community & Youth Music Library, in order to retain the initials CYM by which it had become known. He recruited eminent musicians as Patrons and Directors and found inexpensive accommodation first in 2010 at a disused school in Lambeth, and two years later at Hornsey Library in Haringey. Tony with Peter continued with all the arduous relocations of twenty tons (or more) of music sets throughout his seventies and retired from active involvement with CYML only at the age of 83. He continued as a Director of CYML until shortly before his 85th birthday.

On the morning of 11 October 2014, two weeks after his 85th birthday, Tony and Sally completed a five-mile sponsored walk in aid of the Cooltan Arts charity to mark World Mental Health Day. That evening he was hit by a car and died of head injuries early the next day. A moving but apposite summary of Tony's life in all its variety and achievement is offered by his friend Jennie Sibley:

“Tony was always willing to stand up and be counted through his words and actions. He was driven by a commitment to fairness and equality between people both individually and across groups in society. He was a family man who shared his wisdom and touched the lives of many. He will be widely missed and well-remembered by many.”¹³

Roger Taylor

¹³ Jennie Sibley, *Op.cit.*

OXFORD'S WESTON LIBRARY: A NEW HOME FOR THE BODLEIAN'S MUSIC LIBRARY

Martin Holmes

The Bodleian Library's music collections are among the largest and most important in the country, serving students and academics within the University of Oxford as well as scholars and others from across the world¹. This article briefly describes the recent transformation of the Bodleian's New Library building into the Weston Library, the new centre for the Library's Special Collections and home to the Bodleian's Music library, although Music forms only a small part of what is a much larger operation.

In common with many libraries, lack of space has been a perennial problem from the very beginning and the history of the Bodleian has been one of constant expansion, ever since the first University library was established in an upstairs room, off the north side of the chancel of the University Church of St Mary the Virgin, in the 1320s. In the fifteenth century, the University built an extra floor on top of the new Divinity School to accommodate the bequest of the manuscript collection of Humfrey, Duke of Gloucester, brother of King Henry V. Following the dispersal of the medieval library in 1550, during the reign of Edward VI, it was nearly fifty years before serious steps were taken towards refounding the library, thanks to the foresight and generosity of Sir Thomas Bodley, whose newly refurbished and restocked Duke Humfrey's Library opened its doors in 1602. Almost immediately, plans were laid for expansion, made all the more necessary by Bodley's agreement with the Stationers' Company in 1610, which would open the flood-gates to a steady stream of new publications received under this forerunner of Legal Deposit.

Despite further expansion in the Old Schools Quadrangle in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, the annexing of the Radcliffe Camera in the 1860s and the excavation of an underground bookstore below Radcliffe Square between 1909 and 1912, a more radical solution to the space problem was required. Cambridge University Library, of course, suffered similar problems in its historic buildings but, during the 1920s, made the (possibly more sensible) decision to build a brand new library on the other side of the River

¹ <http://www.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/weston/finding-resources/guides/music>

Cam, with plenty of space for expansion. Oxford, on the other hand, decided to retain the historic buildings for the Bodleian and add a large new structure, on a cramped site on the other side of Broad Street, which would act principally as a vast book stack to serve the reading rooms in the Old Library and Radcliffe Camera far into the future.



Fig. 1 Exterior from Broad Street

For the New Library, Oxford chose the same architect as Cambridge, Sir Giles Gilbert Scott. The foundation stone was laid by Queen Mary on 25 June 1937 and building was well advanced by the outbreak of war in 1939, when it was commandeered for use by the Admiralty's Inter-Service Topographical Department (which played a crucial role in the planning of the D-Day landings) and other war purposes. The underground floors provided temporary accommodation for priceless collections moved from institutions around the country to escape the Blitz. These included the King's Library from the British Museum, stained glass from various Oxford colleges and, at the request of Imogen Holst, her late father's music manuscripts from her London home. The building was eventually opened as a library by King George VI on 24 October 1946, who famously broke the ceremonial key in the lock.

Since the Bodleian is a reference-only, mostly closed-access library, the central core of the building was designed as a book stack, spread over eleven floors, around which were located offices, workshops and reading rooms. The three underground floors and the tunnel under Broad Street, with its mechanical conveyor linking the New Library with the Old Library and Radcliffe Camera, became the stuff of legend and prone to gross exaggeration by generations of Oxford students and tour guides!

The precise function and configuration of the rooms around the perimeter of the building evolved over the years and, in 1973, the Music Reading Room was moved from its cramped quarters in the Lower Reading Room of the Old Library to the second floor of the New Library which enabled reading room, specialist staff and practically all the closed-stack music collections to be conveniently clustered in close proximity. After more than thirty years in this near-ideal location, a need to save money by rationalising the reading rooms in the building led to the closure of the separate Oriental, Map and Music reading rooms in 2007 and their consolidation in the former PPE reading room on the first floor.

By the end of the twentieth century, the New Library building had become very run down and the changing use of spaces over time often involved unsightly partitioning which had obscured many features of Scott's original design. Not only was the building full to overflowing, for many years it had been recognised that it failed to meet modern standards for the preservation of archival collections and it became a constant worry that the whole thing would go up in smoke. Proper environmental controls were needed and the existing structure of the book stack was a fire hazard of major proportions. Something urgently needed to be done and it was clear that a radical solution was required.

As part of the Bodleian Libraries' wider estates strategy, the opportunity was taken to re-purpose the New Library as a centre for the study of Special Collections, which would enable it to provide greatly improved storage conditions for the Library's most important treasures, and the facilities to allow much greater engagement with those collections, by students, academics (both local and from further afield) and by the public at large. Such facilities had been woefully lacking in the Library to this point. However, in order to re-develop the site in this way, not only would the funds need to be found but the building itself would have to be completely emptied, of books, staff and readers. Once that had been achieved, a total reconstruction of the central section of the building could begin and, because of its listed status, a more measured remodelling of the office and reading room spaces in the outer sections. This would enable the restoration and reinstatement of many original Gilbert Scott features which were either never fully realised or else obscured as the use of the building gradually changed with the passage of time.

A solution to the space problem was found in a plan to build a large off-site, high-density book storage facility – a glorified warehouse but with conditions appropriate for the storage of books and other library materials, and systems designed for the rapid retrieval of books to supply the needs of library readers. Attempts to find a suitable location in Oxford failed but eventually a plot was purchased on the outskirts of Swindon which could accommodate a large building, containing 247 linear km (153.5 miles) of shelving and capable of storing about 8.4 million books, with room for further expansion. The BSF (as it is known) was opened in 2010 so the plan to refurbish the New Library – dependent as it was on a space being found into which the contents of the book stack and around one hundred staff could be decanted – could finally go ahead, once sufficient funds were in place.

Emptying the New Library would be a major exercise. Many ‘back-room’ staff were squeezed into a building beyond the river on the Osney Mead industrial estate, including conservation staff and archivists, who would move to join library systems staff and others already there. For some, this move would be permanent as staff in what was formerly the Technical Services department (cataloguers, acquisitions and legal deposit operations teams, etc.) would not expect to return to the central site. With the closure of New Library reading rooms for western and oriental special collections, maps and music, the consultation of rare books and manuscripts was transferred to a part of the Lankester Room in the Radcliffe Science Library (RSL) a short distance up the road, along with a large portion of the associated special collections themselves, which were moved to occupy space recently vacated in the RSL stack. Space was found for the consultation of Maps and Music, along with their respective open-shelf reference collections, in ‘Selden End’ (an early seventeenth-century extension to the fifteenth-century Duke Humfrey’s Library), although accommodation for staff was very limited. Despite its impracticality for the operation of a modern library service, there was a sense in which Music staff felt privileged to be exiled to this beautiful room for the duration of the work.

Moving the remaining 4-5 million volumes from the New Library book stack to the newly-opened BSF in Swindon was no simple matter. The BSF was designed very much as a modern warehouse facility to make the most of space and efficient retrieval methods for twice-daily deliveries of requested material to central Oxford. Rather than store the books in classified or shelf-mark sequences, the books were to be kept in trays according to size and retrieval would depend entirely on an automated system which would track the items using only the barcodes on the items themselves. The problem was that only a tiny proportion of the Library’s stock had a physical barcode attached, so a massive programme of barcoding of the collections had to be hurriedly devised and resourced so that the book move could begin. This was to be

challenging enough for the general book and journal collections and a team of temporary barcoders was employed to stick barcodes to books and record the barcode numbers in the item records in the catalogue.

For Music, there was the additional complication that only a relatively small proportion of the collection was actually included in the online catalogue. Most of the sheet music is either bound into volumes or stored in boxes and there was not the time, resource nor (to some extent) the desire to stick a physical barcode onto each individual item. In any case, barcodes would be of use only for material catalogued online and, since a complete box or volume would be retrieved for readers, rather than an individual item of sheet music, in most cases, there would not be a one-to-one relationship between a bibliographic record in the online catalogue (where they existed) and the unit which would actually be retrieved from the BSF. For this reason, requests for most printed music would need to be mediated by staff, rather than ordered directly online by readers so, for music, it was decided to apply barcodes to the volumes and boxes, the units which would actually need to be ordered and retrieved from the BSF. Pseudo-bibliographic records (which became known as Inventory Control Project or ICP records) would have to be generated for each of these 'retrieval-units' to enable the material to be ingested into the BSF and subsequently retrieved when needed. The records were generated semi-automatically from data linking shelfmarks with barcodes, recorded on spreadsheets created by Music section staff over a period of about three months during the winter of 2010-2011, supplemented for twelve weeks by a temporary addition to the team.

Music readers would continue to request items against the bibliographic records in the online catalogue, or by completing paper forms for card-catalogue items, but Music staff would intercept those requests and place additional orders on the system for the relevant barcoded boxes or volumes using the new Inventory Control Project (ICP) records. It was felt that, given the relatively small number of requests for music, this procedure would not generate an unmanageable amount of extra work for staff and it would be compensated for by the fact that Music staff themselves would no longer be fetching the items from the stacks.

As collections were barcoded, they were gradually moved out over a period of nearly a year, the last books leaving the building just in time for the demolition team to move in, in the summer of 2011. Over the next twelve months, the central core of the building was demolished, taking care to leave the façade and the rooms around the perimeter intact for sympathetic reconstruction or restoration. A huge crane, nick-named 'Bodzilla', was installed in the middle of the site to enable the rebuilding of this central area.



Fig. 2 The Blackwell Hall

The completed building (designed by Wilkinson Eyre Architects and re-named the Weston Library, in honour of a major donation from the Garfield-Weston Foundation) now contains three underground floors of book stack, three reading rooms² with further open-access reference areas, a large public space (the Blackwell Hall) containing a café and display cases, giving access to two new exhibition galleries and a lecture theatre. Above all this ‘floats’ a spectacular gallery and the Visiting Scholars’ Centre³. There are also seminar and meeting rooms of various sizes and a Digital Media Centre, a room to be equipped with ‘high-end’ equipment intended to keep pace with future developments in digital scholarship. The restored Gilbert Scott rooms around the perimeter of the building contain offices for curatorial staff, space for the processing of archival collections and splendid new conservation workshops. As many of the original Scott fixtures and fittings as possible have been retained

² The Sir Charles Mackerras reading room (for Music), the Rare Books and Manuscripts reading room (including maps) and the Charles Wendell David reading room (for Oriental materials and Commonwealth and African studies).

³ Funds are being raised to endow a number of library fellowships, enabling established scholars in various fields to spend time working on the Library’s collections and, in return, to contribute, in various ways, to the scholarly and cultural life of the Library and University. The first Albi Rosenthal Fellows in Music for 2015-16 have just been selected.

and restored, including desks, chairs, light fittings – even waste paper bins! The Broad Street front has been tastefully remodelled to provide a welcoming new public entrance; the whole of the exterior of the building has been given a good clean and now looks transformed in the Oxford sunshine.

The Music reading room has been generously endowed in honour of (and now in memory of) the conductor Sir Charles Mackerras. This occupies the room intended as the catalogue hall in the original building, and the design of the new bookcases hints at this former purpose – the housing and consultation of the old typed or printed catalogue slips which were painstakingly pasted into hundreds of massive ‘guard-books’. Skylights flood the room with natural light for the first time since the war⁴. Material requested from both the Weston stacks and the BSF in Swindon is delivered to the reserve desk in the Mackerras room which also serves the adjacent Rare Books and Manuscripts reading room, with its spectacular wooden ceiling restored.

Music now has much more space than it had in the old reading room, allowing for considerably expanded open-access reference collections, which spill over into the adjacent gallery area. This has enabled us to have some music scores on open access for the first time in living memory in the form of selected composer collected editions and other major music series, such as *Musica Britannica*, the various *Denkmäler* sets, *Corpus Mensurabilis Musicae*, *Recent Researches* volumes, etc. The annexe at the west end of the room will contain audio equipment and an electric piano. It is intended that a member of the Music staff will be on duty in the room for as much time as possible during core opening hours to provide assistance for Music readers when required.

One by-product of the whole exercise has been the welcome incorporation of data from the Music card catalogue into the online catalogue (SOLO: <http://solo.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/>). Early in the Weston Library planning process, it became evident that space would not be found for ‘old-fashioned’ card catalogues in the new building and we were lucky to secure a grant from the Paul W. Mellon Foundation which enabled us to scan the cards and hand-written slips which had provided the only access to the Music and Map collections from the 1880s until 1992 when online cataloguing for printed music began. During our period of exile from the New Bodleian, a project was started which saw over half-a-million catalogue cards scanned and the data keyed by an external company⁵. A small team of local editors checked the keying and made minor improvements to the data. As an interim measure, the card images were made available for browsing using an online ‘flipbook’ viewer

⁴ Almost as soon as the original building was completed, the skylights were covered with concrete for bomb protection which was never removed.

⁵ See *IAML (UK & Irl) Newsletter*, no. 66 (Oct. 2013), p. 14-15 (http://www.iaml.info/iaml-uk-irl/publications/newsletters/newsletter_2013-10.pdf).



Fig. 3 The Sir Charles Mackerras Reading Room

but the keyed data has now been incorporated into the main catalogue. While the records are basic and conform to a variety of older standards, the fact that they can now be searched alongside records for music scores created online since 1992 is a major step forward in improving access to the music collections.

As with any major building project, a few delays and teething problems are inevitable and it will be some time before all the collections are moved into the building and everything is fully functional. Nevertheless, the building

opened to readers in time for Michaelmas Term 2014 and the public areas were unveiled in March this year. We are still experimenting with the best ways to staff the building, given very limited resources, and workflows will continue to evolve as time goes on. An official opening ceremony is being planned for the autumn by which time we should all feel much more settled into our new surroundings.

Access to the Bodleian Libraries is granted to virtually anyone who can demonstrate a valid reason to use the collections (see <http://www.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/using/getting-a-readers-card/procedure> for information on admissions). The exhibition galleries are open to the public, free of charge, and tours of the historic buildings are available. There is a busy programme of public events throughout the year (<http://www.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/whatson>). For more information on the events leading up to the reconstruction of the Weston Library, see: Michael Heaney and Catriona Cannon (eds.), *Transforming the Bodleian*. Berlin : De Gruyter Saur, 2012. (Current topics in library and information practice). ISBN: 9783110289213; 9783110289398 (e-ISBN). Weston Library website: <http://www.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/weston>

Abstract

This article describes the move of the music collections from their old home in the Bodleian Library, Oxford, while it was refurbished, and the challenges encountered with providing a remote service. The newly rearranged building within the original façade is fit for purpose and the collections have now returned and can be accessed in improved conditions.

*Martin Holmes is Alfred Brendel Curator of Music
at the Bodleian Libraries, University of Oxford.*

PUTTING ALL YOUR EGGS IN ONE BASKET: LIBRARY CATALOGUES FOR THE TWENTY-FIRST CENTURY

Claire Marsh

The twenty-first century has brought with it big changes for music libraries. Budgets have shrunk, social media has changed the way we market collections and services, and, in the UK at least, student fees have increased the expectations students have of academic libraries.

One area that has seen a major upheaval is that sacred cow of libraries: the catalogue. Changes in bibliographic description have come about through FRBR and RDA, and the catalogue is now expected to interact with library users via social media, rather than the bibliographic records remaining the preserve of the catalogue. The change under consideration here is the move from standalone library catalogues for each library, and lots of individual e-resources, to single resource discovery systems that search all resources in one go.

Before 2011, the information provision at my library at Leeds College of Music was typical of a higher education library, in that you searched in the OPAC for our physical library stock, and in various other search interfaces for the online resources we subscribe to. Being a music college, the online sound resources were a separate but critical add-on to the library offer. So to the user, the library collection was one collection, the online bibliographic databases, or, increasingly commonly, full-text online resources were totally separate collections.

While all resources were available to all students, there would inevitably be those who do not learn or bother to use all the different search interfaces. Some would only use the library stock, while others would focus solely on JSTOR (www.jstor.org), meaning that assignments could be completed without setting foot in the physical library. The less well-known resources would frequently be ignored, as would those that do not offer off-site access.

This paper considers the benefits of resource discovery systems in general, and the possible benefits and drawbacks of implementing one of three of the main players in the resource discovery market at a specialist music library. I will also give a case study of the implementation of resource discovery at

Leeds College of Music, and demonstrate some of the features of the system. To see this presentation in the form it was given at the IAML conference in Antwerp 2014, go to <http://www.lcm.ac.uk/eggs>

Benefits of resource discovery

The theory behind resource discovery is that all of these resources are brought together into a single search interface, meaning that all resources are available to all students at all times. Most standard library e-resources can be accessed through most resource discovery systems, especially those from the larger publishers. There is one exception that I will come to later. Library catalogues can be either uploaded permanently to the resource discovery system, or searched in real time through Z39.50. Systems can also be set up to include searching of local repositories, and may also include collections of free online resources that are within the system's central index. This should encourage students to use resources that they otherwise would not bother with, or maybe would not know about.

One thing all these systems have in common is faceted searching. This allows the broadening or narrowing of searches on-the-fly, and will often be easier and quicker to use than an OPAC's search limiters. This is particularly important in a resource discovery system, as it allows the limiting to particular datasets, including full-text resources. This is probably a favourite of students who have left their assignment until the last minute! Various other catalogue enrichment features will also be available, depending on the system used. These may include book jackets, links to Amazon, book abstracts and reviews, plus links to any available online versions of print resources. So, even if a book is on loan and is not available as an ebook, there may well be a link to the Google books version. Then it's just luck whether the page the user needs is available or not! Also, there may be some benefits in reading the contents page, foreword, afterword etc., and this may help a user decide whether it is worth placing a reservation on the item or not.

So, what does this mean for the user? They have ideally only one interface to learn to use, which is probably very Google-like, and this improves the ease with which user education can be delivered. Additionally, it means that there is more time in that user's education to focus on the hopefully small number of resources not included in the resource discovery system. It can also improve serendipitous location of library resources. The first-year student who is looking for books, may stumble upon the journal articles they didn't even know existed. A lecturer looking for a CD may instead find a streamed recording of the same piece.

Drawbacks of resource discovery especially for music

I was lucky enough to attend the Music Libraries Association conference in California in 2013. While there, I heard a panel of users of WorldCat Local, Summon and Primo, three of the leading systems available, discussing how resource discovery had worked for them. Please bear in mind that these comments, although they are system-specific, do in some cases relate to the other systems too, to a varying degree. The overwhelming opinion was that while there were great benefits of resource discovery, none of these resources work perfectly for printed and recorded music. These are the key points that were causing problems with each of the systems.

WorldCat Local uses FRBR principles to try to collect editions together. This works well for books. However, for printed music it pays no attention to the musical presentation statement, which results in different arrangements of the same work appearing to be the same item. This can obviously make it very hard to find some items! There have been improvements to this over the past year, and it is far less of an issue now.

Summon has no controlled vocabulary for format types, so facets tend to breed. There can be limiters in place for music score and for sheet music, depending where the resource is coming from. Only the facets with the most hits are shown, and a further click is required to show the full list of facets. This means it is easy for a user to think they are seeing all relevant hits, when many more are hiding in the facets. You can't, however, limit by carrier, so CDs and LPs will all be included in the facet 'music recording'.

In the past, Primo was quite limited in which resources it included – some quite key providers were missing. However, the field has evened somewhat between the main systems. Alexander Street Press, an important provider of music resources, is now present in all the main systems, and certainly in WorldCat Local it is easy to switch on their collections individually. Naxos is charging extra for its MARC records to be used in WorldCat Local. I cannot comment on how well this works as we have chosen not to purchase these records and instead instruct our users to access Naxos directly. Subscribing would feel like paying twice for the same resource.

EBSCO is an interesting case, as it has refused to licence its content outside its own Resource Discovery System, EBSCO Discovery Service. A recent announcement from EBSCO has made some metadata available for searching in other systems, in exchange for integration or collaboration. If a working partnership can be developed with a vendor then other data, including some full text, will also be made available. However, crucially for us all, specialist subject databases are excluded from this deal. EBSCO's position, as I understand it, is that specialist databases require specialist search interfaces, not resource discovery systems, unless it's their own system of course! That said, it is possible to hack it in WorldCat Local, or to use hacks that other

people have created. Primo have been very vocal about EBSCO's refusal to collaborate fully, and set out their position in an open letter last October¹.

Unfortunately, I think that it is inevitable that resources will be developed in the first place for the more mainstream (and financially well-supported) subjects, and those for which the resources available are much less complex. In other words, subjects that are predominantly text-based have the largest possible user-base, and are relatively easy to put together. Music, as is often the case, will be an afterthought, and won't be fully developed until there are users demanding it and willing to work closely with providers in the development.

As an aside, I would like to commend the work Rock's Backpages did for Leeds College of Music. Rock's Backpages is a huge database of pop music writing. However, they were a small business, and were not initially well set up for group subscriptions. We told OCLC that it was essential that Rock's Backpages was searchable within our WorldCat Local. OCLC and Rock's Backpages were extremely proactive at working towards this together and quickly created a Z39.50 link allowing the searching to take place. It would seem that if a small company like this can get their resource involved in resource discovery, then it should be possible for the large data companies.

Resource Discovery at Leeds College of Music

In Spring 2011 Leeds College of Music was given a sum of money to enable us to transfer from being an independent college to a limited company and a part of the Leeds City College group. We had just a few months to spend it, or it would be lost. One of the projects we were keen to work on was the implementation of resource discovery; however, we didn't have enough time to fully investigate all the possible systems. The three main players in the field were Summon, Primo and WorldCat Local. We spoke to all three, mostly covering the range of resources that could be searched with their systems. Although there were differences, the general answer was that mainstream resources such as JSTOR and Oxford Music Online were available, or soon would be, but that more niche resources, such as Naxos Music Library and Desktop DJ would be much harder to include. Other resources fell between these two points.

We decided to work with WorldCat Local, because it is an OCLC product. One critical relationship that needs to be in place for resource discovery to work is between the provider of the library management system and the provider of the resource discovery system. We have an OCLC library management system (LMS), so, with little else to base our decision on in a tiny

¹ Ex Libris (2014), *Update on Ex Libris discussions with EBSCO*. Available online: http://www.exlibris-group.com/category/EBSCO_Update_October2014 [Accessed 26/03/2014]

amount of time, we felt that having just one provider for both LMS and resource discovery would make implementation much more straightforward.

We started work on implementation in Summer 2011, and after a long and difficult process we are now using WCL as our only library catalogue, and are encouraging students to use this as a first step for any research.

How should it work?

Setting up the database side of WorldCat Local is a three step procedure.

First a library needs to upload its catalogue to the WorldCat database, ideally matching bibliographic records to records already there.

Then the system needs to be configured to allow access to resources the library subscribes to that are already indexed in WorldCat. This includes databases, online journal subscriptions and other e-resources.

Finally a Z39.50 link must be set up for any remaining resources, where possible. At Leeds College of Music this comprises Oxford Music Online, Alexander Street Press and Rock's Backpages.

After this, any searches made on the library's WorldCat Local instance will bring back results from all possible print and electronic resources.

How did it work in reality?

The first, last and most difficult step during Leeds College of Music's WorldCat Local configuration has been the uploading of our catalogue into the WorldCat database. Our data was exported from the library management system, then OCLC uploaded it into WorldCat, where the theory was that most of the data would match with items already there, and the remainder would create new records. This worked beautifully for books, where the unique identifier of an ISBN made it all very easy. Later on when we added our ebook subscriptions into WorldCat Local they also matched with the print books, so that when you search for a book you see the print and electronic versions in a single catalogue entry.

CDs and DVDs matched fairly well, due to the publisher's number, and, where they didn't, the newly created records are fine. Some records were returned unmatched and unadded, but these were few enough to be able to work through and match manually, or create new records in WorldCat.

Printed music was a different matter entirely! With the lack of unique identifiers in printed music, vast quantities of the stock failed to match, some stock matched incorrectly, and the data that was extracted from our catalogue was inadequately detailed to enable the creation of new records on WorldCat. This was due to a combination of very old catalogue records where insufficient

fields were completed, newer records where we have tweaked our cataloguing rules to suit our users, but have strayed too far from AACR2, and problems with the way MARC records are extracted from our LMS. In addition the way WorldCat made assumptions about missing information led to numerous occasions when our record matched with a different expression or manifestation of the work.


The rather drastic solution to this was the removal of all our music from WorldCat, and then manually matching the entire collection. This was going to be time-consuming but not especially hard, and the bulk of it was carried out by library counter staff in summer 2013, and financed by OCLC. The whole of the library stock is now on WorldCat, and the reserve stock is following closely behind, and will be complete in the near future. Although it has been a laborious process, the results are excellent and searching works well.

LCM.WorldCat.org

So now Leeds College of Music has its own instance of WorldCat, at the very tidy url above, and has a very pleasing appearance (figure 1). The search box looks like Google, and mostly works like Google, so users are generally very comfortable using it without training. The only search option at this stage is


Leeds College of Music Library | Search | WorldCat | Check account details (Sign in) | WorldCat (Sign in)

This site uses cookies. By continuing to use the site, you are agreeing to OCLC's placement of cookies on your device. [Find out more here.](#)

 LEEDS COLLEGE of MUSIC

Search Leeds College of Music Library and beyond

Search

[Advanced Search](#) Search with 

Databases: JSTOR Music Collection, Naxos Music Library, Oxford Music Online, and other databases (2)

Languages: [Česky](#) | [Deutsch](#) | [English](#) | [Español](#) | [Français](#) | [Italiano](#) | [Nederlands](#) | [Português](#) | [עברית](#) | [한국어](#) | [日本語](#) | [中文\(繁體\)](#) | [中文\(简体\)](#)
 You: [Sign In](#) | [Register](#) | [My WorldCat](#) | [My Lists](#) | [My Watchlist](#) | [My Reviews](#) | [My Tags](#) | [My Saved Searches](#)
 WorldCat: [Home](#) | [About](#) | [Help](#) | [Get E-mail Updates](#) | [Feedback](#) | [Search](#)
 Legal: [Copyright © 2001-2015 OCLC. All rights reserved.](#) | [Privacy Policy](#) | [Terms and Conditions](#)

WorldCat is the world's largest library catalog, helping you find library materials online.

Fig. 1

to switch between searching just items accessible to Leeds College of Music members and broadening out to the whole of WorldCat. There is a link to user account details, which goes back into the library management system, and any useful links can be configured under the ‘Leeds College of Music’ menu. At the bottom of the screen you can easily switch the page to different languages, and there is also an option to sign in to WorldCat itself (a separate login from the College’s local ones) and take advantage of personalisation options.

A search on the term ‘music copyright’ gives the following results (figure 2). The search is easily limited by using the facets down the left-hand side of the screen. This allows, amongst other things, easy access to items of different

Search results for 'music copyright' limited to Leeds College of Music Library

Databases (5)

- WorldCat.org (422)
- JSTOR Music Collection (109)
- Oxford Music Online (98)
- Rock's Backpages (6)
- Naxos Music Library (0)

Results 1-10 of about 428 (.57 seconds)

[Select All](#)
[Clear All](#)
[Save to:](#) [New List] [Save](#)

Sort by: [Library and Relevance] [Save Search](#)

Available online

Full text

Format

All Formats (428)

- Article (203)
 - Peer-reviewed (112)
- Encyclopedia article (98)
- Book (49)
 - Print book (36)
 - eBook (13)
- Musical score (36)
- Music (33)
 - eMusic (21)
 - CD (11)
- Video (9)
 - DVD (6)


Refine Your Search


Author


- [Laino Dave \(6\)](#)
- [Whiteley Sheila \(6\)](#)
- [Brooks Tim \(6\)](#)
- [Blaukopf Kurt \(4\)](#)
- [Knighton Tess \(4\)](#)
- [Show more...](#)

Year

- [2009 \(13\)](#)
- [2007 \(13\)](#)
- [2005 \(15\)](#)

1.  **Music copyright law**
 by David J Moser; Cheryl L Slay
 Print book [View all formats and languages >](#)
 Language: English
 Publisher: Boston, MA : Course Technology, Cengage Learning, ©2012.
 Database: WorldCat
 Libraries that own this item: Leeds College of Music Library
[Availability](#) [View all editions >](#)

2.  **Steal this music : how intellectual property law affects musical creativity**
 by Joanna Teresa Demers
 Print book : State or province government publication [View all formats and languages >](#)
 Language: English
 Publisher: Athens : University of Georgia Press, ©2006.
 Database: WorldCat
 Libraries that own this item: Leeds College of Music Library
[Availability](#) [View all editions >](#)

3.  **Pop song piracy : disobedient music distribution since 1929**
 by Barry Dean Kernfeld
 Print book [View all formats and languages >](#)
 Language: English
 Publisher: Chicago ; London : University of Chicago Press, ©2011.
 Database: WorldCat
 Libraries that own this item: Leeds College of Music Library
[Availability](#) [View all editions >](#)

1 of 1 available

Leeds College of Music Library 2WK - Available 658.78 KER


4.  **The musician's guide to licensing music : how to get your music into film, TV, advertising, digital media, and beyond**
 by Darren Wilsey; Dayle Deanna Schwartz
 Print book [View all formats and languages >](#)
 Language: English
 Publisher: New York, NY : Billboard Books, ©2010.
 Database: WorldCat

Fig. 2

formats (most important for differentiating between recordings and scores) and to full text items only. It's possible to limit articles to 'peer-reviewed' too, which could be helpful for researchers. Most books and many other items have covers which improves the attractiveness and readability of the page, and clicking on 'availability' gives the user a real-time look into the local catalogue to see if a copy is on the shelf.

A full record has basic bibliographic information (figure 3), and fuller description is available further down. The links at the top allow you to export the citation, print it, email it, add it to a list (this function is within WorldCat), share it on one of around 300 social media sites or simply access a permalink to catalogue page. Because this particular item is available both from the library shelf and as an ebook, links to both are available here.

The screenshot shows a library record page for the book "Brilliant project management: what the best project managers know, do and say". At the top, there are navigation links: "<< Return to Search Results", "Cite/Export", "Print", "E-mail", "Add to list", "Share", and "Permalink". On the left is the book cover, which features the title "brilliant Project Management" and the subtitle "What the best project managers know, do and say". To the right of the cover, the title is repeated in a larger font, followed by the author "Stephen BARKER; Rob COLE", publisher "Pearson, 2009", edition "Print book : Revised", and database "WorldCat". Below this is a section "Find a copy online" with a sub-section "Links to this item" showing "Leeds College of Music Library (1)" and a "View eBook" link. Another section "Find a copy in the library" shows "Leeds College of Music Library" with a "Get it in the library" button and a summary "3 of 3 available". A table below lists the availability of three copies.

Location	Status	Call number	Notes
Leeds College of Music Library	2WK - Available	658.4 BAR	
Leeds College of Music Library	2WK - Available	658.4 BAR	
Leeds College of Music Library	Reference - Available	658.4 BAR	

Fig. 3

Conclusions

Although it has been a long and often painful process, I am glad to have had the chance to implement Resource Discovery. It has made user education easier, and has encouraged the use of a mixture of electronic and physical resources. The “google box” type searching is more intuitive to students, and the facets much more user-friendly than the search limiters we used to have.

We have a long way to go before we have explored everything that WorldCat Local has to offer. In future I would like to integrate it with our purchase request and inter-library loan functionality. As users have the ability, by selecting ‘libraries worldwide’, to search the whole of the WorldCat database, I would like them to be able to order any item they find at the click of a mouse. There is also a whole new world of reading lists that we have not yet made use of, but has the potential to be very useful. I have no way of knowing whether the journey would have been easier or harder had we opted for a product from one of OCLC’s competitors. Most likely there would still have been problems of some sort, but they would probably have been different ones.

Being at the start of a new development is bound to have its problems, especially if you are a less typical user than most, but it is also exciting to feel you are pushing boundaries, and ultimately very rewarding. By the end of the project our users had seen a huge improvement in how they accessed the library resources, and as technology advances we are well placed to put in place any further possible improvements that may arise.

Abstract

The music library at Leeds College of Music has replaced a standalone library catalogue with an integrated resource discovery system allowing the search and retrieval of physical and electronic items and resources from inside and outside the physical library in a single search, using a google-style interface. This paper describes the decision-making process, the benefits and pitfalls of the implementation, and problems particular to music in such a project.

Claire Marsh

MELODISTS: THE MELODISTS' CLUB LINGERS ON -
From 277 words to obscurity in 131 years and seven editions

Oliver B. Pollak

To our social band, prosperity!
And let our motto simply be—
The soul of music—Melody

Motto by John Parry (1776-1851)

Print encyclopedias, once a mark of the “enlightenment,” pillars in the organisation of knowledge, and authoritative sources of knowledge, have been joined, supplemented, and replaced by the electronic information revolution, but we ignore earlier print editions at our peril, and look forward to the continuing promise of online sources.

The poet George Ellis Inman (1814-1840) received two prizes from the Melodists Club, 10 guineas in 1838 for his lyrics, “The Days of Yore,” and 15 guineas in 1840 for the words to “St. George’s Flag of England”. My article “Death of a Poet at a Young Age: George Ellis Inman” describes his literary accomplishments and his eventual suicide in St. James Park.¹ But what of the Melodists that favoured him?

The printed British Museum Catalogue, and more recently the British Library online catalogue, list a fifteen-page pamphlet, “Melodists’ Club, 1840 (Rules, etc), 7899.cc.4.(1).” A request to see this item in 2000 went unfulfilled, accompanied with a pencilled message, “Destroyed in WWII.” German bombs destroyed many lives, homes and written records, including those of England’s oldest musical club, the Madrigal Society of London, housed at Carpenters’ Hall. Music libraries, interlibrary loan, online web searches, and antiquarian music bookstores proved fruitless. The missing document appeared to quash an extended treatment of the club. However, in early 2014 the editor of *Brio*, Katharine Hogg, informed me that in 2012 the British

¹ Oliver B. Pollak, “Death of a Poet at a Young Age: George Ellis Inman,” *Platte Valley Review* 28 (2000), pp. 89-96.

Library had accessioned "Melodists' Club: Visitors' Books and Rules of the Club 1824" (MS Mus 1777).

Thirteen men met at William Mudford's (1782-1848) house in Bloomsbury at the end of the season on June 24, 1825 and formed the Melodists whose "object is the promotion of melody and ballad composition." They elected Mudford president and W. Jerdan vice-president.²

Thirteen of the detailed forty rules were devoted to selection, rights and duties of members; thirteen to the anonymous and secret selection, promotion and publication of new songs, lyrics and poems; and several rules to programming and visitors.

The elitist membership, aristocratic patrons and subscribers, gentlemen and accomplished artists, was limited to sixty. Members paid an entrance fee of five guineas, and an annual subscription of eight guineas. Applicants receiving "One black ball in ten" were denied membership.

Honorary memberships, for vocalists, composers, poets and musicians, limited to twenty, were given to Englishmen, Germans and Italians – these included Beethoven, Cherubini, Rossini and Weber. The Melodists were a larger club than the older and more elitist Noblemen and Gentlemen's Catch Club founded in 1761, and the Glee Club founded in 1787.

Aristocratic and royal family patrons, from its founding until 1832, included the Marquis of Bristol, Marquis of Downshire, Earl of Charleville, Lord Saltoun, Lord Garvagh, John Fane (the 11th Earl of Westmorland) and Lord Burghersh, a composer of madrigals and glees, who was President of the Royal Academy of Music for 37 years. Royal family patrons included the Duke of Sussex and the Duke of Cambridge.

The Melodists dined seven times a year, in season, at the Freemasons' Tavern on Great Queen Street. They ate, drank and listened to music. Wine purchases were subject to the following rule: "No wine to be allowed of a higher price than six shillings per bottle unless wholly at the expense of the parties by whom it may be ordered." Members received five tickets for the Annual April concert; three tickets were ". . . for the admission of Ladies only". Tickets to the 1pm concert held in Freemasons' Hall were priced at half a guinea in 1828. It was noted that the 1839 audience at Freemasons' Hall included a "great many ladies."

Melodists encouraged and published original works in "the style of the old masters." Pieces were submitted anonymously for publication to promote even-handed consideration and avoid favourites; it appears that texts were submitted by members, which were then selected and allocated to composers

² "The Melodists," *Quarterly Musical Magazine and Review* IX (1827) pp. 487-91. This article contains the programmes with titles, composers and performers for 28 pieces performed at the Morning Concert on April 26, 1827, and 21 pieces on April 22, 1828. Mudford, like Inman, would publish in *Bentley's Miscellany* which started in 1837.

(‘according to alphabetical order’) to set to music. Royalties and copyright were shared between composer, musician, performer, and one tenth went to the club treasury. In 1827 John Sinclair published the ballad, “Hey the Bonnie Breast Knots,” the first fruits of the Melodists’ publishing programme.³

“Melodist” is a term distinctly associated with the first half of the nineteenth century – the *Oxford English Dictionary* defines it as “A singer; a musician. Now rare. In the first half of the 19th cent. frequently used in the titles of collections of songs.” The term appeared in several song collection titles from 1800 to 1837, for example *London Melodist*, *British Melodist*, and *National Melodist*. They ranged from *The Melodist* (1840), a 24-page song-book with 39 songs, to George H. Davidson’s two-volume *Davidson’s Universal Melodist* (1847) with 1,630 songs.

Music clubs sponsored prize competitions to encourage new compositions. The Noblemen and Gentlemen’s Catch Club awarded prizes from 1763, followed by the Glee Club, Beefsteak Club, Liverpool Apollo Glee Club, Manchester Gentlemen’s Glee Club, Philharmonic Society of London, and Adelphi Glee Club. In 1831 the Melodists introduced prizes; ten and five guineas, for first and second prize medals, awarded for the best song and best duet. As many as 217 songs were submitted, vetted down to about four to six songs for presentation before an audience, which in 1836 included “upwards of sixty professors and amateurs of music.”

John Parry (1776-1851), Honorary Secretary of the Melodists, raised the issue of the club’s posterity in 1838 in *The Musical World*:

That antiquarians, some three or four centuries hence, may not be at a loss for the origin of the Melodists’ Club, whose proceedings have been so frequently recorded in the musical archives of England, I shall give a brief sketch of its rise and progress., trusting that it may prove not altogether uninteresting to the present generation.⁴

Club activities were announced and reported in *The Musical World*, *The Illustrated London News*, *The Spectator*, and *The London Literary Gazette*, all of which became available online in the twenty-first century. Parry observed that club banquets entertained upwards of four hundred guests; “. . . nothing of any great moment can go on very prosperously in England, without a dinner.”

The Dictionary of Music and Musicians, edited by Sir George Grove, appeared in its first edition in 1878, and Charles Mackeson (1843-1899), one

³ “Music, New Publications,” *The Literary Gazette*, March 31, 1827, p. 204. There were at least seven printings of this song between 1825[?] and 1879 in England and the United States.

⁴ John Parry, “The Melodists’ Club,” *The Musical World*, February 9, 1838, pp. 83-5. Parry also wrote short descriptions of the Catch Club and the Glee Club.

of over eighty contributors to the *Dictionary*, distilled the Melodists' Club into 277 words.

Subsequent editions of Grove's *Dictionary* lined library shelves and the publisher's coffer. The last sentence of the 273-word entry for the Melodists in the five-volume second edition (1904-10) added, "After 1856 it must have ceased to exist." The five-volume third edition (1927), at 247 words, dropped the last sentence and added the duration caption '1825-1856', and the same entry was used in the fourth edition (1940). The nine-volume fifth edition (1954) reduced coverage to 161 words. The "indispensable" twenty-volume *New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians* (1980) disposes of the Melodists' Club in 34 words, a one-sentence entry under London, VI: 4, Concert life—Concert Organizations:

"There were also many less important organizations; these included ones with specialized interests such as the Melodists' Club, founded 1825 by admirers of Charles Dibdin 'for the promotion of ballad composition and melody.'"⁵

And the final ignominy: the twenty-nine volume *New Grove* second edition, published in 2001, deletes the Melodists' entirely, not a word.

Tastes change, cohorts age, some clubs survive and others disappear.⁶ The founding of the Royal Philharmonic Society in 1813, the Royal Academy of Music in 1823, and the Melodists' Club in 1825, represented efforts to maintain distinctive English music and encourage musical training in England. Four additional music groups emerged during the 1830s and five in the 1840s.⁷ Popular concerts, other entertainment and the Victorian music hall fostered new tastes.

"Weeding" or de-accessioning earlier editions and consigning them to the recycler's shredder may be a disservice. The shrinking Melodists account through the different edition of Grove demonstrates that bigger and newer encyclopaedias do not necessarily make better reference works, and that topics have a shelf-life and fade into obscurity as interest and involvement wanes. The sociology of knowledge and printed page space limitations take their toll.

Encyclopaedias are not accretive. Editors preparing new editions update information, incorporate new material, revise old material, expunge incorrect

⁵ Charles Dibdin (1745-1814) was a colourful English composer, dramatist, poet, novelist, actor, singer, balladeer, and entertainer.

⁶ For longevity see Viscount Gladstone, Guy Boas, and Harald Christopherson, *Noblemen and Gentlemen's Catch Club: Three Essays towards its History*, (London: Noblemen and Gentlemen's Catch Club at the Cypher Press, 1996).

⁷ John Weale, *The Pictorial Handbook of London* (London: Henry G. Bohn, 1854).

information, and delete “uninteresting” material. When an editor cuts old copy there is a loss of knowledge and understanding. Preserve the prior editions. Newer is not better.

The Melodists were “unwritten” in Grove by the inexorable force of time. Historians form fragmentary evidence into a new story, endeavouring to preserve the disappeared and overlooked in a way that the present can appreciate.

The Melodists, elite English music lovers, were connected by social life and profession. Aspiring and accomplished musicians performed at convivial meetings. The Melodists’ met and entertained from the 1820s to the 1850s and slipped into obscurity. This essay, an effort to reverse or stay their undeserved obscurity, demonstrates the process of encyclopaedia memory loss.

As newspapers, journals, books, and reference works are scanned and the web extends its reach into the past through Google and the like, increasing amounts of Melodist and other intelligence will re-emerge. Thus, although conventional print diminishes knowledge of the Melodists, the web will eventually enhance it, and propagate fresh research.⁸

Abstract

The Melodists Club flourished in the early nineteenth century but soon fell into oblivion. The author traces its history through the few surviving documents, and uses the Melodists Club to demonstrate the need to keep older editions of music dictionaries, which frequently include information that is excluded from more recent editions.

*Oliver B. Pollak is Emeritus Professor of History
at the University of Nebraska at Omaha*

⁸ See for example, Christina Margaret Bashford, “*Public Chamber-Music Concerts in London, 1835-50: Aspects of History, Repertory and Reception*,” Doctoral Dissertation, University of London, King’s College, 1996.

BOOK REVIEWS

Edited by Loukia Drosopoulou

The land of opportunity: Joseph Haydn and Britain, edited by Richard Chesser and David Wyn Jones. London: The British Library, 2013. 208 p. ISBN: 9780712358484. Hardback. £40.00.

This review could be very short: a heartfelt commendation to the reader of the excellence of the eleven essays in this splendid volume, certainly a worthy addition to any bookshelf, and not simply those of musicians. Or, it could reach heavenly lengths (risking the Editor's intervention with a blue pen) as there is so much to say about each of the said essays. A middle course, then, is called for, somehow. . . .

The dust jacket sums up the overall purpose of the volume very neatly: "The essays in this volume examine the relationship between the composer and the commercial, political and social world and help explain the unparalleled popularity Haydn and his music have enjoyed ever since". Its genesis was a conference held at the British Library in 2009 to mark the 200th anniversary of Haydn's death. The work's specific focus is the years from 1780 when Haydn began to engage in musical life beyond Esterhazy – and especially with Vienna and London. Indeed five of the essays concentrate on aspects of his two visits to London whilst others look either at the Austrian connection or at the inter-relationship between the two. Finally there is a consideration of two contemporary biographies and of the Haydn materials held at the British Library.

The line-up of contributors is impressive: all eminent in their fields, all writing with a clarity and engagement which makes the work a pleasurable – as well as informative read. The book itself as a physical object is a delight – plentifully illustrated with a dust jacket bearing the portrait of Haydn by Hardy which we all know and love (of which more below).

We begin with a masterly overview of the book's theme from David Wyn Jones. Haydn's own pleasure at the financial benefits derived from his many performances in London (whether at the King's Theatre or Hanover Square Rooms) as part of the organised, vibrant concert scene is contrasted with the absence of similar arrangements in Vienna. Jones also takes a close look at the relationship between impresario Salomon, publisher John Bland and composer/performer Haydn in the commercial context of concert promotion,

considers Haydn's attitude to his symphonies, the role of the English press in making him the centre of attention (much to his delighted bemusement), his enthusiastic response to the commercial opportunities which developed with publishers (especially Longman and Broderip, Artaria's agents in England) as well as concert promoters. Jones then takes a step back and considers how Haydn personified a sense of international solidarity between England and Austria both politically and culturally, made manifest in his 'Austrian anthem', "Gott erhalte" modelled on "God save the King", later adopted in England as the hymn "Glorious things of Thee are spoken", and in reverse with his Sailor's song ("High on the giddy mast") published in Vienna with a suitable translation.

The second chapter affords a fascinating glimpse of Haydn's interest in art through the prism of the six prints by the caricaturist Henry William Bunbury which he owned and for which, it would seem, he had a special affection. Perhaps the composer felt the artist's sense of humour was akin to his own, ever-present in his compositions. They included a pair of prints on the theme of patience – a popular topic at the time. Thomas Tolley takes the reader through each of the prints, not only setting them in the context of their time and pointing out the social and political commentary they depict and the metaphors deployed to do this, but also how their themes would have resonated with Haydn. *Bethnal Green*, for example was "aimed primarily at amusing men who longed to escape their wives' control, such as Haydn". For another, *A smoking club*, Tolley suggests (and this is a delightful speculation) "the arrangement perhaps appealed to Haydn since the four seated figures and their gestures correspond closely with the traditional grouping of the members of a string quartet in performance". I, for one, will never be able to listen to a quartet in action again without this image being invoked. Tolley also offers an enlightening exposition on the late eighteenth-century English society association of smoking with radical politics.

Alan Davison revisits an old favourite: Thomas Hardy's 1791 portrait of Haydn (now at the Royal College of Music), looking specifically at how it was commissioned to influence Haydn's reception in England at the time, forming part of the publicity campaign undertaken by John Bland (who would use the 1792 engraved version on the Haydn scores he published) and Salomon to promote the composer. Davison sets the scene for the portrait, discusses the composition of the painting itself and the message thus intended to defend Haydn's genius against those who would argue otherwise.

Who would have thought that there would be a connection between Haydn and the illicit provision of bodies for dissection? There are not six, but only two degrees of separation because Anne Hunter, one of the most successful songwriters of the time and the librettist of the first set of Haydn's Canzonettas was married to Surgeon Extraordinary John Hunter (whose vast

collection of anatomical specimens now forms the core of the Hunterian Museum of the Royal College of Surgeons). Caroline Grigson's informative study of the partnership between the two is fascinating, as is her exploration of the role of Thomas Holcroft, author of the 1794 poem *Haydn* heaping lavish adulation on the composer, in the choice of words for the second set of Canzonettas and his provision of English texts for several of Haydn's songs.

David Rowland turns his attention to the world of publishing. He explores in particular Clementi's role as one of the partners of Longman, Clementi and Co. (the firm which arose from the ashes of the ill-fated Longman and Broderip) and the contract between Hyde and Haydn of July 1796, which gave the firm, on the face of it anyway, exclusive rights to publish Haydn's works. Rowland unpicks this as an example of misplaced optimism in the face of reality and in a commercial environment where international copyright laws were but a gleam in the eye of the future. Haydn was no fool when it came to business arrangements and chose his contacts carefully and cannily, treading a delicate path between the English firm and his publisher Artaria in Vienna. Rowland investigates this fascinating triangle, presenting a tightly-woven detective story, following the fortunes of the second set of the Op.76 string quartets and *The Creation*.

By some miracle, Haydn's huge collection of music manuscripts and printed music has survived almost intact, preserved in the National Széchényi Library in Hungary. Balázs Mikusi explores its riches, concentrating on the scores which were published in Britain and any manuscripts which it is possible to be sure that Haydn acquired whilst in London. By far the majority are of vocal music. Many of the pieces are dedicated to him and include instrumental works by Graeff, Bertini and Clementi along with vocal pieces by the Webbe family, Calcott and Attwood. Mikusi closes by posing the intriguing question of how/whether these British composers' works influenced Haydn's own compositional style.

It is perhaps easy to forget, amongst our delight at Haydn's symphonies and chamber music, that he also composed operas and that it was an activity he took very seriously. In his contribution to this work, Otto Biba looks at this so often overlooked aspect of Haydn's output, and at his wider role in opera productions at Esterhaza, which for anyone other than Haydn would have been a full-time occupation. In particular, Biba gives an intriguing account of Haydn's work as an editor of libretti for performances, using the specific example of *Piramo e Tisbe* of 1777 by Marco Coltellini to show how Haydn amended the work to clarify the drama and establish credible characters.

We remain in Austria for the next essay: Ingrid Fuchs on who would have performed and listened to Haydn's chamber works. At the time (and indeed for some considerable time afterwards), a thorough musical education which

included the ability to play at least one instrument to a very high standard was considered an essential accomplishment of the “nobility and gentry” and their families. The musical “salon” became a focus of social life involving both these dilettante and professional players. Fuchs looks in particular at several of the lady pianists (such as the Augenbrugger sisters, Marianne Genzinger and Barbara Ployer) to whom Haydn dedicated works, and then turns her attention to the string quartets, where the performers were almost exclusively male, charting the gradual migration of performance from the salon to the concert hall.

A change of focus follows, from performance to publishing, in Rupert Ridgewell’s lively account of a curious anomaly concerning Artaria’s publication of Haydn’s Op. 40 Piano Trios. He sets the context for this with a timely reminder of the rich body of Haydn material held at the British Library and the challenges facing the cataloguer in 1949, before setting out on this intriguing bibliographic mystery. It is concerned with why, contrary to Artaria’s usual practice, they published both upright and oblong string parts for these trios, when normally they would only have issued oblong parts to go with the piano score in the same format. This seemingly simple difference, we discover, reflects much wider issues in Artaria’s business arrangements, not least in their working relationship with Haydn.

The penultimate contribution to this volume takes up the vexed question of biographical myths. Christopher Wiley selects three stories from Haydn’s later life and consider how they have been treated as Haydn biographical work develops. What, for example, is the real story of the monument to the composer at Rohrau: did Haydn really visit it and become emotionally overwhelmed as Pohl suggests, or was he (as the earliest accounts of his life imply) simply aware of its existence? And what about the detail of the occasion of the performance in March 1808 in Vienna of *The Creation* which Haydn attended? How had it become regarded as “a dress rehearsal for Haydn’s death”? Wiley considers the role of such tales and how they impact on the genre of musical biography.

Last, but far from least, Arthur Searle gives us a cogent account of the Haydn manuscripts held by the British Library which include four of the “London” symphonies alongside several sets of instrumental parts, letters and contracts. Searle takes the reader lovingly through this treasure trove, describing not only the manuscripts themselves, but their route into the Library whether through purchase or donation, finishing with a complete list of manuscript sources held. It is surely fitting that at least some of the works Haydn wrote whilst in England have found their permanent home here. It is surely even more fitting that we have a volume of such excellence devoted to aspects of Haydn and Britain. Hats off to all involved I say!

Richard Maunder, *The Scoring of Early Classical Concertos, 1750-1780*. Woodbridge: The Boydell Press, 2014. vii, 300 p. ISBN: 9781843838937. Hardback. £60.00.

Few concertos from the period 1750-1780 are in the standard concert repertoire, with the exception of those by Mozart. Little attention has been drawn to the genre between the Baroque and the Classical, when hundreds of now-forgotten works were written. To name a few, apart from those by lesser-known composers, the concertos of J. C. Bach, G. B. Sammartini, Carl and J. Stamitz were conceived in these years, together with some late works by Telemann, Graun, Leclair and the early ones by Mozart, Haydn and Dittersdorf. Apart from its historical significance, this repertoire offers an opportunity to find fine works which can be revived and performed; additional reasons to study these concertos might be to understand the development of the genre and how this music was performed.

Although this might seem too ambitious a task for just one person, it is achieved to a fair extent by Richard Maunder in this book, a sequel to *The Scoring of Baroque Concertos*, published in 2004. As a result, Maunder's many years' work with concertos and his experience with printed and manuscript sources arguably make him the leading specialist in this area. Maunder's views on the repertoire are based on extensive work with sources, and probably no other author can claim to have studied so many concertos from the period 1685-1780.

As with most books on primary sources, this work also spares readers a considerable amount of time and work surveying and locating the repertoire; the number of concertos discussed or mentioned exceeds 300, of which some eighty are editions. This can be considered as a broad enough sample for this study, and gives an idea of the effort needed to summarise the range and depth of the survey in just 300 pages. Primary sources are, in this case, printed or manuscript performance material. At a time when it was very rare to have scores printed or copied, most musical works were disseminated as sets of parts, which provide important information regarding performance practice. This is explicitly acknowledged when discussing Thomas Linley's violin concerto where we read that: "in absence of the original parts, it seems impossible to decide whether any of the string parts are meant to be doubled" (p. 270).

Maunder is mainly interested in establishing how each concerto was performed, judging from the music itself and from the number of parts which have survived. Each individual set of parts of a given concerto – which means a particular *version* – is discussed, sometimes together with a second set of parts or even the composer's holograph. The conclusions make good sense, and no attempt is normally made to conclusively establish the "right"

instrumentation or the proper size of the ensemble. In fact, an alternative performance suggestion is sometimes offered.

As in his previous book, Maunder demonstrates that the idea of “concerto” in this period is quite similar to our concept of “chamber music”, rather than “orchestral” or “symphonic”. Although some general trends in Europe and England are identified, there was not such a thing as a “standard” practice when playing or writing concertos, which were conceived by composers as chamber music and were realised as such by performers. Only one or perhaps two performers would play each string part (normally two in the 1770s), and just a small ensemble of some twelve musicians would be required, including wind instruments and continuo. Even so, there could be concertos intended for just four players, such as G. Sammartini’s op. 9 or J. C. Bach’s op. 1.

It must be understood that Maunder’s discussion of the proper size of *each* orchestra or ensemble only concerns the set of parts discussed in each case; in other words, there is no attempt to propose ideal - still less, mandatory - numbers, although the survey’s results strongly suggest that there would not have been more than two instrumentalists for each part, and the use of double bass and harpsichord should not be taken for granted. There were also significant local and chronological variants concerning the tutti, the continuo, and the number of players.

Another important contribution in this book illustrates what could or could not have been done when performing this repertoire. Issues such as the possible use of pianoforte/harpsichord, or what the keyboard should do when not being offered a soloistic part are discussed, as well as when to add or remove double strings or a sixteen-foot bass. The doubling of string parts or part-sharing is thoroughly discussed, and it becomes clear that considerations of balance are also a good criterion for deciding whether to double violins or the lower strings, as in the Baroque concerto. Many interesting questions are raised, such as the interpretation of certain expression marks or the discussion of the actual keyboard instrument that might have been used for a certain concerto.

Following a sound introduction, the book is structured in seven chapters, dedicated to Northern and Central Germany, Italy, Vienna, Salzburg, the South German Courts, Paris and England. This geographical approach offers a sufficiently representative selection of concertos, but can also cause occasional inconsistencies. However, overall this strategy proves useful and allows us to see that local differences existed when playing (or copying) this music. For instance, a composer like J. C. Bach is mainly discussed in two chapters (“Italy” and “England”), and there are indeed noticeable differences between his Italian concertos and those written after 1762, when he moved to London. Yet, although the text is organized on broad geographical lines, there is a clear emphasis on German-speaking courts or cities, while Italy is the shortest

chapter of all and England as a whole receives the same number of pages as Salzburg. Also, almost all examples in the “Paris” chapter date from the 1770s, with only one from the 1750s and another dated 1769.

Such an extensive work, even when limited to the years 1750-1780, can easily have gaps when reduced to 300 pages. One example can be found in the scarce allusions to musical form, which are confined to the Introduction and to occasional references throughout the text. Despite the author’s declared aim to examine how ideas about instrumentation, size of ensembles and form evolved, there is little about form. Thus in the first chapter one can clearly conclude that among composers of concertos active in Berlin in the 1750s, classical concerto-sonata form quickly became established, whereas a more thorough and systematic approach to aspects of form would be desirable, had it been feasible. While this is perhaps inevitable in a book with such a wide scope, it shows how difficult a comprehensive approach to this repertory can be, even more so if it is limited to a few hundred pages.

It can be concluded that one of the main virtues of this book is also a weakness. While its most outstanding feature is the vast number of concertos discussed in varying length, there is no easy way to present all this information, which may lead to some disorientation on the reader’s part. Here the summary included at the end of each chapter proves useful, although many nuances are naturally lost. Another strong point of the book is the effort to properly illustrate the text; Maunder explicitly refers to musical features of 165 concertos, which can easily be followed through the 322 examples included, normally scores three to eight bars long.

This book must be saluted as an achievement and the result of many years’ work with primary sources. It is certainly useful for understanding how concertos were scored and performed in the period 1750-1780, and together with Maunder’s previous work on the Baroque concerto constitutes a sound revision of this repertoire. Maunder also opens promising paths for further research: aspects such as Sammartini’s “miniature sonata” pattern, or the parallelism between Garth’s concertos (chapter 8) and the ensemble concertos of Dittersdorf and Hofmann (chapter 4), show that the author could have developed his study of musical form, had there been more space; the same can be said of the resemblance between *sinfonia concertante* and ensemble concerto, or the evolution of the keyboard concerto in these years. While so much is said in so few pages, this is not just one book that serves its purpose; it also encourages reading about the repertoire, and leaves the impression that much more remains to be said, had the author been given the opportunity.

Germán Labrador López de Azcona

Musical Theory in the Renaissance, edited by Cristle Collins Judd. Farnham, Surrey: Ashgate, 2013. xxx, 604 p. ISBN: 978-1-4094-2297-6. Hardback. £195.00.

This is a major collection of reprinted essays on Renaissance music theory and one of many similar collections recently published by Ashgate. The volumes as a whole have come under criticism for the amount of reprinted material that can be easily found on resources such as JSTOR. Although the editor of this collection has made an effort to include diverse sources such as books and prefaces of critical editions, there are still at least six articles (out of eighteen) that are available on JSTOR, plus one essay, Paolo da Col's 'The tradition and science' (1999), that has been reduced to such a small print that it is virtually unusable.

With the volume exorbitantly priced at £195 it is difficult to recommend it for purchase when more than 200 of its 600 pages are available elsewhere (and everything is a reprint to begin with). One could have justified it had Ashgate priced the volume competitively in order to make it available to people who do not have access to a well-stocked library and/or digital resources, but at the current price it is difficult to imagine many individuals who could afford it. It is therefore destined for major libraries, ironically the same places that also hold the original items.

With economics out of the way, one can concentrate on the contents of the book, which cannot be faulted. The volume contains some of our most seminal work in the field by a cornucopia of distinguished scholars of the past and present. One of them is the editor of the collection, Cristle Collins Judd, who provides an excellent introduction and delineates the parameters on which she has based her choices, aiming to give a broad panorama of approaches and methodologies. The field of Renaissance theory is a difficult one given the particular point in European thought when new understanding and discoveries, fuelled by the advent of Humanism and the re-discovery of antiquity, brought about a re-definition of religion, intellect, and the cosmos. Add to the mixture the complication of writing in a difficult (and dead) language, Latin, and you have an explosive cocktail where understanding is often close to mis-understanding.

The essays are grouped in four sections on fundamentals and terms, on classical authorities, on major individual theorists, and on national traditions. Many renowned scholars are represented: Margaret Bent, Bonnie Blackburn, Harold Powers, Claude Palisca, Maria Rika Maniates, Gary Tomlinson, Jessie Ann Owens, Dinko Fabris, Philippe Vendrix and others.

While the essays are a little too varied to form an overall narrative, reading them as a whole does impart a few coherent thoughts about the field, its

difficulty and preoccupations. Whether by chance or by design, Judd has chosen authors who all seem to be aware of the art and pitfalls of writing history, and who handle well the historiographical distance of things so complex and so far removed from us. This is what makes them great scholars, the ability both to examine the 'object' in hand and at the same time remain self-aware of how they approach it. As Judd says, her goal 'has been to show *how* modern scholars have approached the study of musical theory' (p. xv).

There are no weak links amongst the essays and those mentioned here are purely those that resonate more with the reviewer. Chief among them is Jessie Ann Owens' 'You *can* tell a book by its cover' (2010), a fascinating foray into a new methodology that constitutes a paradigm shift for the way we look at treatises and early books in general. Following a model first established in literary studies, Owens describes English music treatises from the point of view of their printing format as broadsheet, folio, quarto, octavo, etc. What this can tell us about the contents and function of the book is often revealing, as it seems that format betrayed use and function and often reflected the socio-economic demographic of the audience. Format therefore can be *read*, and just about as intelligibly as the words themselves. For its path-breaking paradigm and for opening our eyes to a new methodology, Owens' work takes pride of place.

An equal pride of place must be awarded to an essay that is not so much path-breaking as it is successful in reaching a kind of illusive perfection between balanced reasoning, acuity, and empathy for the past. Bonnie Blackburn's 'On compositional process in the fifteenth century' (1987) demonstrates above all a scholarly attitude and as such it should be read by all aspiring musicologists. Her precise and temperate voice calmly negotiates the past by respecting its voice. The creative ego that often accompanies great scholars is diverted here into the understanding of theorists as people, in this case Johannes Tinctoris, while treading without fireworks on a quest of precision. If more people took the time to do this there would be much less coming and going about scholarly debate and opinion, as people would really take the time to understand better the issues at hand.

Blackburn's insistence that 'in interpreting the ideas of any writer [. . .] no term must pass unexamined' (p.66), brings her approach close to the intertextuality issues that are at the centre of Ronald Woodley's 'Renaissance music theory as literature' (1987), an essay that encourages us to attend to the literary context within which music theory was created. Woodley draws attention to the intellectual backgrounds of authors - in this case Tinctoris and his indebtedness to Cicero's *De oratore* - pointing out that language and terminology are key to interpretation. Given how distant and removed from us some of these technical texts are, intertextuality seems even more important here than interdisciplinarity.

Sarah Fuller's 'Defending the *Dodecachordon*: Ideological currents in Glarean's modal theory' (1996) is fascinating in a different way as it introduces a level of anthropological - even psychological - appreciation of Heinrich Glarean, the man and the thinker. The Renaissance was a difficult time for precise rational thinkers who looked for truth and re-interpreting the past, while at the same time negotiating their commitment to the religious status quo of their time. This was an inner turmoil often faced by progressive individuals who lived at a point when scientific thought brought about a conflict with established deo-centric views of the world. People like Glarean wanted to follow the path of free thinking but without losing their place in society, their place in the world as they knew it.

The theorists who emerge as protagonists of this whole panorama are Johannes Tinctoris, Pietro Aaron, Heinrich Glarean, and Gioseffo Zarlino. *They* seem to be the true pioneers of the period and the ones on whom we mostly concentrate our efforts today in an attempt to decipher their meaning. Aaron is the subject of Harold Power's magisterial 'Is mode real?' (1992), an essay that has provided a benchmark for generations of scholars. Powers' incredible intelligence shines through every sentence of his essay and, as style of prose, contrasts well with the less flamboyant but equally shrewd and precise Claude Palisca, the foremost scholar of our time on musical humanism. Palisca has done a great service to the field by re-positioning Aristoxenus as a central source of the Renaissance in his 'Aristoxenus redeemed in the Renaissance' (1994). Aristoxenus was in antiquity already an early proponent of equal temperament, the notion of which fundamentally inspired theorists such as Giovanni Maria Artusi, Vincenzo Galilei, and Zarlino. This excellent volume also contains important contributions by Margaret Bent on *resfacta*, Ruth DeFord on diminution and proportion, Inga Mai Groote on Glarean as editor and exegete of Boethius, Gary Tomlinson on modes and planetary theories, Paolo da Col on the importance of Zarlino's *Istitutioni harmoniche*, Maria R. Maniates on Nicola Vincentino's *Ancient music*, Dinko Fabris on Italian lute tablatures, Klaus Wolfgang Niemöller on 16th-century German music theory, Philippe Vendrix on the dissemination of French theory, Tom Ward on the practice of music and theory in European universities, and David Irving on the dissemination of Renaissance theory in early modern Asia.

Vassilis Vavoulis

Understanding Boccherini's Manuscripts, edited by Rudolf Rasch. Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2014. 258 p. ISBN: 9781443856638. Hardback. £44.99.

This book is of significant importance for the future of Boccherini scholarship, and the first study published in the UK since the 1965 translated biography of Boccherini's life and work by Germaine de Rothschild. Its eight chapters, written by renowned Boccherini experts, deal with aspects of Boccherini's manuscripts that have not sufficiently been studied until now, and offer valuable insights into Boccherini's professional career.

In the first chapter, the editor of the volume, Rudolf Rasch, classifies Boccherini's career into five periods and describes the survival of five types of manuscripts that the composer produced for his use, comprising reference scores; performance parts; dedicated scores; additional scores or additional parts; and publication scores. These are held in different libraries; the Bibliothèque nationale de France, Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin, Biblioteca Palatina de Parma, and Library of Congress.

From the first period (1760-1770) to the last (1798-1804), Rasch identifies the different Boccherini manuscripts that survive in each library, for which patrons Boccherini worked in each period, as well as his publishers. The small number of Boccherini autographs that survive today is, according to Rasch, the result of the low value that publishers gave to manuscripts once they had been used for the preparation of an edition, and in general, the little interest that Boccherini's music received in the nineteenth century.

In the next chapter Germán Labrador proposes the study of Boccherini's primary collections together with paper studies as a means to establish a chronology of Boccherini's productivity. Boccherini's five primary collections are the composer's own collection; that of Boccherini's patron the Infante don Luis de Borbón; that of his later patron King Friedrich Wilhelm II of Prussia; that of the Duchess of Benavente – whose orchestra Boccherini directed from 1786 until 1787; and that of a certain Mr Boulogne.

While Boccherini was in the service of the Infante don Luis de Borbón (1770-1785) it is estimated that he composed 270 works of which 174 are known today. In order to please his patron the King of Prussia, Labrador argues that the composer sent him works between 1786 and 1797, which, however, appear to have been composed during his service with the Infante. These works are now located at the Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin in the Königliche Hausbibliothek collection. The collection of the Duchess of Benavente survives solely in an inventory dated from 1824 in which are listed works by Boccherini together with the year of composition. The existence of the final collection of Mr Boulogne is known from a letter of 1798 which

Boccherini sent to his publisher Ignace Pleyel, where he acknowledges having sent him works for publication, which had previously been offered to a ‘Mr Boulogne’.

Labrador also notes inconsistencies between the chronology of Boccherini’s manuscripts, based on his paper studies, and composition dates listed in Boccherini’s two complete catalogues of his works, that of 1879 which was published by his great-grandson Alfredo Boccherini: *Luis Boccherini: Apuntes biográficos y Catálogo de las obras de este célebre maestro publicados por su biznieta* (‘1879 Catalogue’ hereafter) and that known as the ‘Baillot’ catalogue from his former owner the violinist Pierre Baillot (*Catalogo delle Opere di Musica composte da Luigi Boccherini*). This concerns works from 1775 until 1788. The discovery of these inconsistencies suggests that studies on stylistic analysis of Boccherini works could lead to erroneous conclusions that should be reviewed in line with this study.

In chapter 3 Loukia Drosopoulou discusses the relationship of Boccherini with his main copyists, the place and period of their activity and the characteristics of their handwriting, and identifies the main characteristics of Boccherini’s own handwriting. She establishes that Boccherini’s calligraphy is clearer in his manuscript parts than his scores as these were intended for performance, whereas the scores were copied to be sent to patrons and publishers. One of Boccherini’s main copyists is identified as the violist Francisco Font who, like Boccherini, was in the service of the Infante don Luis. A large number of his manuscripts survive today at the Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin. This library also possesses parts prepared from scores sent by Boccherini to King Friedrich Wilhelm II, which are primarily in the hand of a court copyist and horn player named Schober. Drosopoulou distinguishes three copyists who prepared parts now at the Bibliothèque-musée de l’Opéra, named Spanish Anonymous nos. 2, 3 and 4, and establishes that certain manuscripts previously considered autograph or doubtful autographs by Boccherini are conclusively in the hand of different copyists and that Boccherini supervised the copying process.

Chapter Four, by Marco Mangani and Federica Rovelli, discusses Boccherini’s manuscript catalogues. Mangani’s contribution focuses on Boccherini’s partial autograph catalogues, compiled as part of Boccherini’s dealings with Pleyel in the late 1790s, which are currently kept at the Biblioteca Nacional de España, the British Library, the Bibliothèque nationale de France, and the Pierpont Morgan Library in New York. Mangani also addresses the nineteenth-century complete catalogues of Boccherini’s works, the ‘Baillot’ and the ‘1879 Catalogue’, and concludes that both catalogues were copied from different sources, and that therefore an archetype must have existed, now lost, from which these catalogues derive. Mangani suggests that, by the end of his life, Boccherini probably revised his catalogue, changing

some information, which could help him to resell the same music to different patrons and publishers. Federica Rovelli studies the differences in the incipits between the autograph catalogues of Boccherini's works and the 'Baillot' catalogue, and the information they offer on Boccherini's habits in cataloguing his works.

In the next chapter, Giulio Battelli discusses manuscript and printed sources at the Biblioteca del Istituto Musicale in Lucca, and focuses on a recently acquired autograph manuscript of the Psalm *Laudate pueri*. Boccherini wrote most of his religious vocal music in his youth, probably at the service of the Capella Palatina in Lucca. However, certain features in the *Laudate pueri* manuscript suggest that this psalm might have been composed at a different time. On the cover is the inscription "Luigi Ridolfo Boccherini Lucchese", which is the name used by Boccherini until he left for Rome, where he would study under Giovanni Battista Costanzi. However, it seems unlikely that a 12-year-old would write such an ambitious work. Also, on f. 24v a short dictionary of Italian-German terms can be found, which according to Battelli implies the manuscript was related to Boccherini's travel to Vienna in 1760-1761.

Chapter Six, by Rupert Ridgewell, is devoted to the intermediaries of Boccherini's dealings with the publishing firm of Artaria in Vienna. Ridgewell identifies Joseph Count Kaunitz-Rietberg, the Habsburg ambassador to the Spanish court, as the main person behind Boccherini's initial contact with the firm, from a recently discovered letter by the Count to Artaria sent from the palace of San Ildefonso (near Segovia) in 1780. This was originally attached to a letter from Boccherini to the publishers, which had reached Kaunitz through his employee Carlo Emanuel Andreoli. Ridgewell studies the letters between Boccherini, Andreoli, Kaunitz and Artaria, showing the sequence of events that would lead to the six editions of Boccherini's works published by Artaria. The involvement of the Habsburg ambassador in Madrid would open a new market for the composer and, eventually, could grant him a new patron. It is not known why Boccherini decided not to send more music to Artaria after 1785, but Ridgewell suggests this might relate to the death of Infante don Luis, his patron since 1769, in the same year.

The next chapter, by Matanya Ophee, is devoted to Boccherini's guitar quintets. The author discusses new manuscripts of these works that have emerged since 1981 and offers new evidence on the complex transmission history of the manuscript sources of these works in the nineteenth century. The chapter discusses the differences between the various surviving sources of the guitar quintets, the copyists involved, as well as the role of important figures in the transmission history of these works, such as that of Louis Picquot, Boccherini's nineteenth-century biographer and main collector of works.

In the final chapter, Jaime Tortella describes five documents concerning the dealings between the British collector Julian Marshall and Boccherini's great-grandson Alfredo Boccherini. Of particular interest is Marshall's wish to acquire an autograph manuscript of the *Scena dell'Inés de Castro*, which Alfredo Boccherini possessed. Tortella notes the important collection of Boccherini manuscripts and documents that his descendants possessed and traded in the late nineteenth century, and concludes that in 1884, apart from the copy of this *Scena* that was owned by the Marquis of Benavent, there were two further autographs of the work: one by Alfredo Boccherini, complete, which remained in the Boccherini family until ca. 1920, and an incomplete manuscript owned by Julian Marshall. It is not known how Marshall acquired his manuscript, but after his death it was sold at Sotheby's in 1904, and was bought eighty years later by the Biblioteca Nacional de España from the Madrid bookseller Porrúa.

Important aspects in Boccherini's scholarship are included in the volume, namely the establishment of a typology of Boccherini's manuscripts; the comparative study of the manuscript's chronology and that revealed by the watermarks; the thorough study of Boccherini's known catalogues; the disclosure of the composer's dealings with Artaria, together with the notice of new autograph sources. All this makes this volume a fundamental reference book for the study of Boccherini sources.

Isabel Lozano Martínez
Biblioteca Nacional de España

IAML(UK & IRL) EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

Officers

President: Peter Baxter (Surrey Performing Arts Library)
Immediate Past President: Richard Chesser (The British Library)
General Secretary: Roy Stanley (Trinity College, Dublin)
Treasurer: Monika Pietras (Royal College of Music Library)
Brio Editor: Katharine Hogg (Gerald Coke Handel Collection, The Foundling Museum)
Education Officer: Geoff Thomason (Royal Northern College of Music Library)
Membership Secretary: Nick Barlow
Newsletter Editor: Margaret Jones (University of Cambridge Library)
Outreach Officer: vacant
Press and PR Officer: Peter Linnitt (Royal College of Music Library)
Publications Officer: vacant

Elected Committee Members

Claire Kidwell (Trinity Laban Conservatoire of Music and Dance)
 Frances Metcalfe (Kent History and Library Centre)
 Grace Toland (Irish Traditional Music Archive, Dublin)
 Rupert Ridgewell (The British Library)
 Ruth Walters (Westminster Music Library)
 Janet Waterhouse (University of Huddersfield)
 Almut Boehme (National Library of Scotland)

IAML Board members

Antony Gordon

Non-voting members

Minutes Secretary: Rebecca Nye (Royal Academy of Music)
 The Music Libraries Trust Representative: Pam Thompson

NOTES FOR CONTRIBUTORS

Brio is the journal of the UK and Ireland Branch of the International Association of Music Libraries, Archives and Documentation Centres (IAML(UK & Irl)), and appears in May and November each year. The editor welcomes articles on any aspect of music librarianship, music bibliography or related musicological research. When submitting material for possible inclusion in the journal, contributors should take note of the following points:

(i) Material should ideally be submitted in electronic form, either as a Word or rtf file, as an e-mail attachment or CD-ROM. Hard copy will also be accepted, either on its own or as a back-up to electronic transmission. This should be on A4 paper, typed on one side and use 1.5 spacing, as should the electronic version. Faxed copy is not acceptable.

(ii) Word-processed copy is preferred in 12-point Times New Roman font. Double quotation marks should be used throughout where relevant and all titles referred to in the text should appear in italic with initial letters only in upper case. Sentences should be separated by a double space and new paragraphs should follow a double line-break but not be indented. Footnotes are preferred to endnotes.

(iii) Accompanying material such as illustrations should be submitted either as in electronic format (JPEG, TIFF) with a minimum of 300 dpi, or camera-ready hard copy.

(iv) Contributions should not normally exceed 6,000 words. Material may be submitted at any time but copy deadlines are generally 1 March and 30 September.

(v) Copyright of material published in *Brio* will be owned jointly by the contributor and by IAML(UK & Irl), unless other arrangements are sought prior to publication. Consequently, material will not be re-published outside the pages of *Brio* by one party without the permission of the other. In cases where permission for republication is granted, a suitable acknowledgement of the source of the original published material may be demanded. IAML(UK & Irl) reserves the right to make *Brio* content available online, either via its website (in PDF format) or via an online journal archive.

(vi) No fee is payable for material published in *Brio*. Contributors of articles will receive one free copy of the issue in which their work appears, and will be free to make photocopies of the whole or part of their work

without the permission of IAML(UK & Irl), subject to the condition set out in (v) above. Contributors of reviews or news items are also free to photocopy their contribution(s), subject to the condition in (v). They will not normally receive a free copy of the journal.

ADVERTISING AND SUBSCRIPTION RATES

Subscriptions

Libraries and individuals in the United Kingdom and Ireland may obtain copies of *Brio* by becoming members of the United Kingdom and Ireland Branch of the International Association of Music Libraries, Archives and Documentation Centres (IAML(UK & Irl)). In addition to *Brio* (published in May and November) they will receive copies of the IAML(UK & Irl) *Newsletter*, published in February and August. International members also receive copies of *Fontes artis musicae*, the journal of the international body: this appears four times a year.

Subscription rates are as follows:

	International	National
Libraries, institutions and associate members	£100/ €117	£69/€81
Personal members	£ 74/ € 86	£52/€61
Retired, student and unemployed members	£ 38/ € 44	£17/€20

NB. Students are allowed one year's free subscription to IAML(UK & Irl). Thereafter membership is charged at the concessionary rate. Proof of student status is required.

Subscribers outside the United Kingdom and Ireland may obtain *Brio* by taking out an annual subscription. This does not entitle them to other benefits of membership. Subscription rates for *Brio* are \$78 or €48 per annum. Administration costs incurred by payment in a currency other than sterling, or at a different dollar rate, will be passed on to subscribers in the form of a surcharge.

Advertising

Brio is distributed to music libraries throughout the UK and Ireland, and has a substantial international readership. It is therefore an ideal way to reach members of the music library profession. Advertising rates are as follows:

Full page back cover:	£160
Half page back cover:	£105
Full page inside back cover:	£110
Half page inside back cover:	£ 75
Full page in journal:	£100
Half page in journal:	£ 70
Quarter page in journal:	£ 50
Inserts	from £125

All rates are based on camera-ready monochrome copy: extra charges will be incurred for other formats. Prices for other advertisement sizes, formats and colour can be supplied on request. Rates are subject to change without notice.

Notes

Famous work in a new light

Giuseppe Verdi

Messa **NEW** da Requiem

BÄRENREITER URTEXT
Edited by Marco Uvietta
Piano reduction by Andrea Campora

Score – BA 7590
Vocal score (Lat) – BA 7590-90

Score, vocal score and the complete orchestral material (wind set, strings) are available for sale

For this scholarly-critical edition, the editor has consulted no less than 16 sources, many more than were ever used for any other edition of the *Requiem*; some of these sources were never evaluated before and one source, a hand-written vocal score, particularly relevant to the evaluation of the *Liber scriptus*, was newly discovered.

As such, this edition offers new philological and editorial decisions regarding phrasing, articulation and dynamics and succeeds in presenting practical suggestions to solve musical problems and those concerning the interpretation of this famous work.

- Verdi's monumental work in a Bärenreiter Urtext edition
- Trilingual preface (Ital/Eng/Ger) in the score
- Idiomatic, uncluttered piano reduction



Bärenreiter on Facebook
<http://www.facebook.com/baerenreiter>



New: Bärenreiter on Twitter
[@BaerenreiterUK](https://twitter.com/BaerenreiterUK)



Bärenreiter

Your next performance is worth it.

Burnt Mill | Elizabeth Way | Harlow | Essex CM20 2HX | UK
Tel (01279) 828 930 | e: info@baerenreiter.co.uk

www.baerenreiter.com

Typeset and produced by The E-TYPE Press
Lakeview Court, Wardington Manor, Wardington, Near Banbury, Oxfordshire OX17 1SW
Telephone: (01295) 758889 www.e-typepress.co.uk